

## **Exploring Performance Appraisal Methods for Employees at Hypermart Mamuju District: A Comprehensive Analysis**

### **Mengeksplorasi Metode Penilaian Kinerja Karyawan di Hypermart Kabupaten Mamuju: Sebuah Analisis Komprehensif**

**Moh. Jaad Elhaque Abhal<sup>1</sup>, Muhammad Arsyad<sup>2</sup>, Rohsita Amalia Rasyid<sup>3</sup>, Iwan Adinugroho<sup>4\*</sup>**

Universitas Muhammadiyah Mamuju<sup>1,2,3,4</sup>

[mamathaque@gmail.com](mailto:mamathaque@gmail.com)<sup>1</sup>, [arsyadstie@gmail.com](mailto:arsyadstie@gmail.com)<sup>2</sup>, [rhs.rasyid@gmail.com](mailto:rhs.rasyid@gmail.com)<sup>3</sup>,

[iwankolil@yahoo.com](mailto:iwankolil@yahoo.com)<sup>4</sup>

\*Corresponding Author

---

#### **ABSTRACT**

*The study investigates the performance appraisal method employed at Hypermart Mamuju District, revealing a result-based system where managers and employees jointly set performance goals. Positive outcomes include enhanced employee motivation, reinforced by rewards and promotions for good performance. However, there are negative repercussions, such as reprimands or even termination for underperforming employees. The research underscores that while this approach fosters goal clarity and motivation, it necessitates careful management to ensure fairness and transparency. Balancing its advantages and challenges, the result-based system proves effective in boosting workforce enthusiasm and productivity within the retail setting, provided that communication, support, and equity remain central to its implementation.*

**Keywords:** Employed, Hypermart, Human resource management (HRM)

#### **ABSTRAK**

Penelitian ini menyelidiki metode penilaian kinerja yang digunakan di Hypermart Kabupaten Mamuju, yang mengungkapkan sistem berbasis hasil di mana manajer dan karyawan bersama-sama menetapkan tujuan kinerja. Hasil positif termasuk peningkatan motivasi karyawan, yang diperkuat dengan penghargaan dan promosi untuk kinerja yang baik. Namun, ada dampak negatifnya, seperti teguran atau bahkan pemutusan hubungan kerja bagi karyawan yang berkinerja buruk. Penelitian ini menggarisbawahi bahwa meskipun pendekatan ini mendorong kejelasan tujuan dan motivasi, namun diperlukan manajemen yang cermat untuk memastikan keadilan dan transparansi. Menyeimbangkan keuntungan dan tantangannya, sistem berbasis hasil terbukti efektif dalam meningkatkan antusiasme dan produktivitas tenaga kerja di lingkungan ritel, asalkan komunikasi, dukungan, dan kesetaraan tetap menjadi inti dari implementasinya.

**Kata kunci :** Karyawan, Hypermart, Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia (MSDM)

#### **1. Introduction**

Human resource management is a part of management science that focuses its attention on managing the role of human resources in the activities of a company. Human resources position humans as an important part of the company's assets. Therefore, the management and maintenance (retention) of employees is one of the keys to success for the journey of a company. The company in achieving a goal requires human resource governance, both in the corridor of system management, and performance management. This is outlined in various implementation activities, such as training/training, comparative studies, on job training, including motivation development and other aspects. Some of the things that have been described largely illustrate that human resource management is one of the important indicators in achieving organizational goals effectively and efficiently. Humans as individuals have lives in various aspects that are very dynamic. Changes in environmental conditions will also have a major effect on the dynamics of human life. Therefore, individuals are required to

have a high adaptation condition so as not to be crushed by the changes that will come. Human resources in the company must always be oriented towards the vision, mission, goals and objectives of the relevant organization. Therefore, human resource management is important in relation to achieving the vision, mission, goals and objectives of the company can be achieved more optimally and provide an overview to all company actors.

Employees are an asset to the company. Performance appraisal of employees is very important to measure the human resource management governance system in order to achieve the goals, vision and mission of a company. Various companies continue to develop an assessment system for the performance of their employees. One of them is Hypermart Mamuju Regency. Along with the advancement of education, technology, information, and civilization, it increasingly encourages people as consumers to be more selective and tend to consume good quality goods or services. This has an impact on the increasingly fierce competition between companies and encourages employees to work effectively and efficiently. That way, the goods / services produced are of high quality so that they have great competitiveness in the market. So important is performance, because employee performance is a benchmark for companies to assess ability, productivity, and provide useful information for matters relating to employees. Performance is the result of a process of combining individual capabilities with individual attitudes towards work and organizational aspects. To help build employee capabilities, positive reviews are needed that can make employees feel confident. Some employees need to get praise and feedback from managers so that they increase their confidence and have the opportunity to advance their careers. Based on this, regular performance appraisals are necessary.

Hypermart is a hypermarket chain that has many branches in the country that officially operated in 2004. In addition to department stores that sell clothing products such as food, Hypermart also has supermarkets or supermarkets that sell necessities. A large business like Hypermart certainly has an employee assessment method to run its business. Based on the author's observations at Hypermart Mamuju Regency, he found a condition where there was an acceptance and dismissal of employees which was certainly carried out in a planned manner and certain methods in assessing employees. Hypermart Mamuju Regency officially opened to the public on May 31, 2018 and is one of the shopping centers that sells various types of basic necessities such as groceries, vegetables, fruits, spices, and other ready-to-eat foods. In addition, Hypermart Mamuju Regency also sells various types of electronic goods, clothing, children's needs, babies, medicines and others. Based on this background, the authors are motivated to conduct research with the title "Analysis of Employee Performance Appraisal Methods at Hypermart Mamuju Regency".

## 2. Literature Review

human resources is a process for obtaining, training, assessing, compensating, and organizing relationships, health and safety, and justice issues owned by workers in the organization. Human resource management is a field of management that focuses on the staffing function in the management process. Staffing activities include determining the qualifications of prospective workers, recruiting, selecting candidates, organizing training and development, conducting performance evaluations and compensating workers. (Fai.2023) Human resource management (HRM) is the utilization of a number of individuals to achieve organizational goals. Consequently, managers at every level must involve themselves with HRM. Basically, all managers get things done through the efforts of others.

(Mondy, 2008) Human resource management is the science and art of managing the relationship and role of labor so that it effectively and efficiently helps realize the goals of the company, employees and society. (Hasibuan, 2019). Human resource management should be included in the strategic goals and plans of the company. There are 5 principles of approach to

human resource management, namely: Human resources are the most important wealth, owned by the organization, while effective management is the key to the success of the organization, Success is very likely to be achieved when the rules or policies and procedures, as well as work mechanisms, which are related to the people of the company are interconnected and contribute to the achievement of corporate goals and strategic achievements, Corporate culture and values, organizational atmosphere and managerial behavior derived from the culture will have a great influence on the best achievement results, Human resource management is related to the integration of all members of the organization involved to achieve goals, The four principles must be embedded in each member coupled with piety and faith in God Almighty. (Fathoni, 2006) Human resource management as part of the management or regulation of individual or group activities has various functions. Differences in HRM functions can also be seen from the diversity of functions described by almost every expert.

According to Hasibuan (2007), there are at least 11 HRM functions, namely planning, organizing, directing, controlling, funding labor, developing, compensating, integrating, maintaining, disciplining, terminating labor relations. The functions carried out by human resource managers have a positive correlation between one another. This means that there is a mutual influence between the functions previously mentioned. If there is an imbalance in one function, other functions will be affected, and vice versa. The implementation of these functions is strongly influenced by the professional performance of the human resource management department or division. Another opinion regarding HRM functions is conveyed by Cherrington in Masram and Mu'ah (2017), namely Staffing/employment, Performance Evaluation, Compensation, Training and development, Employee relations, Safety and Health, Personnel Research. "Human Resource Management (HRM) has various objectives, as outlined by Mu'ah (2017) and Adamy (2016): First, in the organizational context, HRM aims to make an important contribution to the achievement of organizational effectiveness. The primary responsibility for managing employee performance usually lies with managers, but HRM divisions are there to provide support in this endeavor.

Second, in the functional dimension, the goal of HRM is to keep its contribution relevant according to the needs of the company. The success of HRM lies in its ability to maintain stability and positive impact in accordance with organizational dynamics. Third, in the social aspect, HRM has an ethical responsibility to respond sensitively to the needs and demands of society. HRM actions are directed at minimizing the negative impacts that may arise from company decisions and policies. Fourth, at the personal level, the goal of HRM is to help employees achieve their individual goals. Employees' success in achieving personal goals will affect how the company retains, dismisses, or motivates them. Furthermore, the main components in HRM include three groups: Employers, who are investors who take financial risks in the company. Their income is highly dependent on the success of the company. Employees, as the company's most valuable asset, have a central role in planning and achieving organizational goals.

They sell their services of mind and labor, and receive compensation according to the agreement. Leaders or managers, have a role in directing and managing subordinates to achieve company goals. Every leader also functions as a personnel manager, managing the team he or she is responsible for (Hasibuan, 2019). The Human Resource Management process is divided into several stages, as follows: Human resource planning is designed to ensure that the necessary personnel will always be adequately provided for, Recruitment is concerned with developing a pool of potential employees in line with the human resource plan, Selection includes using application forms, curriculum vitae, interviews, salary skills, and dipping into information from references to evaluate and screen potential employees for managers, who will ultimately select and accept candidates, Socialization (orientation) is designed to help the

selected person fit seamlessly into the organization. Newcomers are introduced to co-workers, familiarized with their responsibilities, and informed about organizational culture, policies, and expectations related to employee behavior. Training and development both aim to improve the ability of employees to contribute to organizational effectiveness. (Soekidjo, 2009: 89). "Human Resource Management (HRM) has a central role in managing a company's valuable assets, namely Human Resources (HR).

In the context of this effectiveness, HRM brings a number of significant benefits. First, HRM allows companies to maximize the utilization of existing human resources wisely. This is done by considering factors such as the number of employees, tenure, knowledge, skills, talents, and interests of individuals. Thus, companies can direct HR more efficiently. Second, through good HRM, companies can increase employee productivity. Proper and balanced placement of employees according to organizational needs helps maintain morale and efficiency. Third, HRM plays a role in planning for future labor needs.

This includes aspects such as internal promotions, filling vacancies, as well as identifying necessary qualifications. With careful planning, companies can remain adaptive to organizational changes. Fourth, HRM is also responsible for managing important information about employees. Starting from the length of service, marital status, to education and training that has been followed, this information is used for better decision making. Fifth, the HRM approach is based on comprehensive research. This ensures that policies and actions taken are supported by accurate data and analysis, helping the company to achieve its goals more effectively (Fai. 2023).

Performance comes from the word job performance which can be interpreted as work performance or actual achievement that can be achieved by a person). Performance (work performance) is the quality and quantity of work achieved by an employee in carrying out his duties in accordance with the responsibilities given to him. (Mangkunegara, 2013). According to Paul Hersey and Kenneth Blanchard, the definition of performance is a result obtained from the ability and motivation that a person has in completing his work or tasks, while according to Harold D. Stolovitch's explanation of performance is a set of results obtained from the act of completing a task or work requested.

Performance or in English is performance, namely: The results of work that can be achieved by a person or group of people in an organization, in accordance with their respective authorities and responsibilities in order to achieve the objectives of the organization concerned legally, not against the law and in accordance with morals and ethics ". Performance is a result of the work that a person achieves in carrying out his duties on skills, experience, sincerity and time. (Hasibuan, 2019). The characteristics of people who have high performance are Have high personal responsibility, Dare to take and bear the risks faced, Have realistic goals, Have a comprehensive work plan and strive to realize its goals, Utilize concrete feedback (feed back) in all work activities carried out, Seek opportunities to realize the plans that have been programmed.

(Mangkunegara, 2002). There are five key indicators used to measure individual employee performance: First, quality indicators measure the extent to which work results reflect expected quality standards and are in line with the employee's skills and abilities. Second, quantity refers to the amount of output produced by the employee in terms of units or cycles of activity completed. Third, timeliness assesses how well employees are able to complete tasks according to a predetermined schedule, while still paying attention to the quality of the final result. Fourth, effectiveness refers to the employee's ability to maximize the utilization of company resources, such as labor, money, technology, and raw materials, to achieve optimal results. Fifth, independence measures the extent to which an employee can carry out their duties independently without requiring excessive assistance. In addition, there is also work commitment, which indicates the extent to which employees are committed to

the company and their responsibilities towards work and tasks in the work environment. (Robbins, 2006)

An employee is a permanent worker who works under the orders of others and receives compensation and guarantees. (Hasibuan, 2019) Employee is a translation of the word performance which means the work of a worker. A management process of work results must have real evidence that can also be measured. (Sedarmayanti, 2011) Employees are the main wealth of a company, because without their participation the company's activities will not occur. Employees play an active role in setting plans, systems, processes, and goals to be achieved. Employees are sellers of services (thoughts and energy) and receive compensation, the amount of which has been determined in advance.

They are obliged and bound to do the work given and are entitled to compensation in accordance with the agreement. The types of employees can be distinguished as follows: First, permanent employees are individuals who have an employment agreement with the company without a specific time limit. They are considered as permanent members in the organizational structure. Secondly, non-permanent employees are individuals who are hired on a contract basis for a specific duration of time. They work when the company requires, according to the agreement that has been agreed upon. Third, private employees refer to individuals who work in non-government organizations through employment contracts. These contracts regulate various aspects including employment status, responsibilities, duration of employment, and compensation (Andiana Moedasir, 2002).

The position of employees in the company is divided into operational employees and managerial employees (leaders). Operational employees are those who perform work directly according to the orders of superiors. On the other hand, managerial employees are individuals who are authorized to give instructions to their subordinates and carry out some of their own work as ordered. However, employee proficiency, skills and abilities are not enough to guarantee good productivity. Factors such as work morale and discipline are also very influential. Motivation to excel is an important key for employees who contribute positively to company goals. Conversely, less capable or less skilled employees can cause delays in the completion of work. The quality and number of employees must be in accordance with the needs of the company in order to run efficiently and effectively in achieving goals. Placement of employees should also be based on their skills and interests.

This will increase morale and discipline, which in turn will support the achievement of company goals (Hasibuan, 2019). To assess employee performance, there are several important indicators that can be used: First, Quality of Work: This involves aspects such as adherence to procedures, discipline, and commitment to duty. Evaluation of work quality includes the extent to which work results are close to expected standards and in line with set objectives. The quality of work is measured based on employees' views of the results produced and the extent to which tasks are completed according to their skills and abilities. Second, Work Quantity: This focuses on the number of results produced, usually expressed in units or work cycles completed. Work quantity assessment is based on the employee's perception of the number of tasks they have completed and the results achieved.

Third, Responsibility: This indicator covers employees' awareness of their responsibilities in carrying out the tasks assigned by the company. The ability to understand and carry out tasks with full responsibility is an important part of performance appraisal. Fourth, Cooperation: This involves an employee's ability to work collaboratively in a team or group. The ability to contribute in cooperation to achieve organizational goals is also an assessment factor. Fifth, Initiative: An employee's ability to take initiative and action without having to constantly rely on instructions from superiors is also an important performance indicator. Through the evaluation of these indicators, companies can gain a better understanding of employee performance and implement relevant improvements. As an

employee, there are responsibilities that must be fulfilled in addition to obtaining rights such as wages or salaries. First, Mutual Respect: Respect for coworkers is a way to value and build good cooperation in the workplace. Second, Obey the Rules: Every company has rules that must be followed by all employees as a form of obedience and discipline. Third, Maintain the Good Name of the Company: Employees have a responsibility to maintain the company's image, both inside and outside the office. Fourth, Establish Good Communication: Effective communication between employees and with external parties can strengthen relationships and open up new opportunities. Fifth, Maintain Work Stability: Maintaining stable work productivity is important. Changes in productivity must be addressed to maintain company stability (Andiana Moedasir, 2002)

Performance management is a goal-oriented process directed at ensuring that organizational processes are in place to maximize the productivity of employees, teams, and ultimately the organization. (Mondy, 2008) Performance appraisal is a formal system used to evaluate individual or team performance, which has a significant impact on the organization's strategic plan and stimulates development and set goals. Environmental factors, both internal and external, can influence the appraisal process, such as legislative requirements, validation support and corporate culture. The appraisal process involves steps ranging from identifying performance goals, setting standards, conducting assessments, evaluating results, to identifying causes of failure and designing improvement plans. Various performance appraisal methods such as 360-degree feedback, rating scales, critical incident methods, and others can be used as needed. However, there are problems in performance appraisal such as difficulty of appraisers, difficulty in measuring objectivity, and potential errors in appraisal. An effective appraisal system should include characteristics such as job-relevant criteria, agreed performance expectations, standardization, trained appraisers, open communication, and periodic performance reviews (Mondy, 2008).

### **3. Research Methods**

This research focuses on Hypermart Mamuju Regency as the research location. The location selection is based on the relevance of the data required to the problem under study. The type of data used is qualitative data, which provides an overview of the object of research. Data sources come from primary data obtained directly from consumers as respondents, and secondary data obtained from related documents and reports. The research population includes leaders, coordinators, supervisors, and employees of Hypermart Mamuju Regency, with a sample of 6 people, selected using purposive sampling method. Data collection was carried out through literature research for the theoretical basis, as well as field research through observation and interviews with leaders, coordinators, supervisors, and some employees. The analysis used is descriptive analysis of a qualitative nature, with a focus on providing an overview of the object of research. Operational definitions are used to define concepts in the research, such as human resource management, performance, employees, and performance appraisal (Sugiyono, 2013).

### **4. Results and Discussions**

In this section, the results of the research that has been conducted and processed to determine the method of employee performance appraisal at Hypermart Mamuju Regency are described and explained. The author distributed 6 questionnaires and conducted direct interviews, where the respondents were leaders, coordinators/supervisors, namely: Store General Manager, Department Manager Personnel, Department Manager Front End, Department Manager Back End, Department Manager Loss Prevention, and Department Manager Supporting. The profile of respondents asked in the questionnaire is age, gender,

latest education and income. The following is the data obtained by the author regarding the profile of respondents based on income, namely:

**Table 1. Classification of Respondents Based on Income**

Pendapatan	Jumlah	Persentase
Rp.1.000.000 – Rp.2.000.000	0	8%
Rp.2.000.000 – Rp.3.000.000	5	83%
Rp.3.000.000 – Rp.5.000.000	1	17%
>Rp.5.000.000	0	0%
Jumlah	6	100%

Source: Processed questionnaire data

Based on Table 5. it is known that out of 6 respondents, 5 respondents with income between Rp.2,000,000 - Rp.3,000,000 (83%), and 1 respondent with income between Rp.3,000,000 - Rp.5,000,000 (17%). Based on this data, it appears that the average income of respondents is between Rp.2,000,000 - Rp.3,000,000, this is because the average respondent is a leader and coordinator/supervisor.

Based on the results of the questionnaire to supervisors who assessed the performance of subordinates, it was found that all Department Managers have good abilities in various aspects. They work on time and use information well. They also have a high sense of curiosity, confidence, and ability. The ability to cooperate and communicate well with coworkers, superiors, and visitors are also their strengths. They help each other and are able to make the right decisions and communicate well when problems arise.

In addition, they are friendly, quick to understand problems, and able to prioritize work and be consistent in making decisions. From the results of the questionnaire to subordinates assessing the performance of superiors, most of the answers show that superiors, especially the Store General Manager, have good traits in carrying out their duties. They are fair in treating subordinates without favoritism and always provide assistance and direction. Communication is well maintained, and responsibility in work is valued. Bosses also have good leadership and encourage subordinates to communicate and solve problems. They can address problems before they escalate, collaborate with different personality types, and evaluate subordinates' performance against set criteria. The supervisor's skills and knowledge support their work, and they are open to feedback. Bosses react appropriately to situations and are able to control themselves, and provide training or orientation to subordinates.

Based on the results of direct interviews conducted by researchers to informants regarding employee performance appraisal methods and performance appraisal models at Hypermart Mamuju Regency, the answers from informants are as follows: "Hypermart Mamuju Regency has its own employee assessment method, namely by using a results-based system model. The assessment method used is flexible to use.

The assessment is in accordance with the characteristics of the employee. How is the quality of work, how is the quantity of work, responsibility, work initiative, emotional stability, loyalty, cooperation, and also the ability to do tasks." In the past, performance appraisal based on a results-based system was a form of management by objectives. A results-based system is a performance appraisal method in which managers and subordinates jointly agree on goals for the next appraisal period. At the end of the appraisal period, an evaluation focuses on how well the employee achieved the goal.

Based on the results of interviews with research informants that the evaluation carried out by Hypermart on performance appraisal is by looking at the achievement report and the results of the instrument given regarding performance improvement, which is as follows: "The indicators used here are first the achievement of targets, then discipline, then loyalty which is

used as an indicator of assessment at hypermart. For example, the targets given by superiors to subordinates are good and reaching the target means that the first indicator has been fulfilled and has good performance. The second is about discipline or SOPs made by superiors have been done or not by employees. For example, the boss makes a rule that employees must come before the front clock in the morning and employees come before that, then it is considered disciplined by their superiors."

Based on the results of interviews with research informants that Nature, Behavior, Competence, Goal achievement, Potential for improvement are the criteria for performance standards at Hypermart and the benefits obtained for the company with the performance appraisal method, which are as follows: "Performance development criteria can be measured objectively, for its development certain qualifications are needed. There are important qualifications for the development of performance criteria that can be measured objectively, namely measurements that show the level of conformity between performance and performance objectives.

For example, speed and accuracy at work can be a more relevant measure of performance when compared to the appearance of employees here." Based on the results of interviews with research informants that during the implementation of performance appraisals, there were no employees who did not accept the results of their work, and no one complained about the performance appraisal method, namely as follows: "Employee performance appraisals are carried out every month, namely at the end of each month we evaluate this including fixed and routine assessments every month. Then there are also annual ones, we do an assessment at the end of the year. For contract employees, it is done every three months. If the work is good then it will be made a permanent employee. During the assessment, there have been no employees who do not accept and complain about the results of their performance assessment".

Based on the results of interviews with research informants, there are procedures for dismissing employees with poor performance and no employees have been dismissed because of this and there are awards for employees who perform well on the performance appraisal, namely as follows: "There are several procedures in dismissing employees who have poor performance, namely, by giving a warning, if they are still with the same attitude, they will be given a warning letter up to three times and then dismissed. Meanwhile, employees who have good performance will be given awards in the form of shopping vouchers, and even promotions". Employees who have worked since the inception of Hypermart in Mamuju Regency, will get a performance appraisal once a year by their direct supervisor. Contract employees every three months and new employees every month. The assessment they receive can describe their work behavior in general.

## 5. Conclusion

Based on the results of research and discussion, it can be concluded that the employee performance appraisal method used at Hypermart Mamuju Regency is a result-based system. This method involves managers and subordinates in agreeing on goals for the next appraisal period. In its implementation, this method has positive and negative impacts. The positive impact of using this method is an increase in employee motivation. With a clear goal agreement, employees feel more motivated to achieve the expected results. In addition, this system provides positive reciprocity for good employee performance, such as the provision of rewards or awards and opportunities for promotion. However, on the other hand, this method also has a negative impact. Employees who do not achieve the expected goals or performance may face unpleasant consequences, such as reprimands from superiors, not receiving rewards, or even the risk of termination.



Overall, the use of results-based performance appraisal methods at Hypermart Mamuju Regency has benefits in improving employee motivation and performance, but also presents risks to employees who do not achieve targets. Therefore, it is important for management to ensure transparency, good communication, and support for employees so that this appraisal system can run effectively and fairly.

## References

- Fathoni, Abdurrahmat. (2006). Organisasi dan Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusi. Jakarta: PT. Rineka Cipta.
- Kustin Ayuwangi D. (2018). Profil Hypermart, <https://.hypermartmerdeka.com>. (Diakses pada tanggal 5 Februar 2021).
- Mangkunegara, Anwar Prabu. (2013). Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia, cetakan kesebelas. Bandung: penerbit PT Remaja Rosdakarya
- Mondy, R. Wayne. (2008). Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia. Jakarta: Erlangga.
- Notoatmodjo, Soekidjo. (2009). Pengembangan Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia, Jakarta: PT. Rineka Cipta.
- Penulisan Proposal Penelitian dan Skripsi. LP3M STIE Muhammadiyah Mamuju.
- Richard L. Daft. (2006). Management (Manajemen), Jakarta: Salemba Empat.
- Robbins, Stephen P. (2006). Perilaku Organisasi, PT Indeks, Jakarta: Kelompok Gramedia.
- S.P Hasibuan, Melayu. (2019). Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia edisi revisi. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Sugiyono, (2012). Statistik Untuk Penelitian. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Sugiyono. (2013). Metode Penelitian Kombinasi (Mixed Methods). Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Tim Penyusun STIE Muhammadiyah Mamuju. 2015. Buku Panduan.